

**Strathfield LEP 2012 - Amendment to list Strathfield Synagogue, at 19 Florence Street
Strathfield, as a local heritage item**

Proposal Title : **Strathfield LEP 2012 - Amendment to list Strathfield Synagogue, at 19 Florence Street
Strathfield, as a local heritage item**

Proposal Summary : **The planning proposal seeks to amend Schedule 5 (and the Heritage Map) under the
Strathfield Local Environmental Plan 2012 to include Strathfield Synagogue, 19 Florence Street
Strathfield, as a local heritage item.**

PP Number : **PP_2014_STRAT_004_00** Dop File No : **14/11673**

Proposal Details

Date Planning Proposal Received : **08-Aug-2014** LGA covered : **Strathfield**

Region : **Metro(CBD)** RPA : **Strathfield Municipal Council**

State Electorate : **STRATHFIELD** Section of the Act : **55 - Planning Proposal**

LEP Type : **Housekeeping**

Location Details

Street : **19 Florence Street**

Suburb : **Strathfield** City : Postcode :

Land Parcel : **Lots 1-5 DP 456916 and Lots 13-15 DP 581**

DoP Planning Officer Contact Details

Contact Name : **Louise Starkey**

Contact Number : **0285754104**

Contact Email : **louise.starkey@planning.nsw.gov.au**

RPA Contact Details

Contact Name : **Frankie Liang**

Contact Number : **0297489995**

Contact Email : **frankie.liang@strathfield.nsw.gov.au**

DoP Project Manager Contact Details

Contact Name : **Diane Sarkies**

Contact Number : **0285754111**

Contact Email : **diane.sarkies@planning.nsw.gov.au**

Land Release Data

Growth Centre : Release Area Name :

Regional / Sub Consistent with Strategy :

Regional Strategy :

**Strathfield LEP 2012 - Amendment to list Strathfield Synagogue, at 19 Florence Street
Strathfield, as a local heritage item**

MDP Number :

Date of Release :

Area of Release
(Ha) :

Type of Release (eg
Residential /
Employment land) :

No. of Lots : 0

No. of Dwellings : 0
(where relevant) :

Gross Floor Area : 0

No of Jobs Created : 0

The NSW Government Lobbyists Code of
Conduct has been
complied with : **Yes**

If No, comment : **The Department's code of practice in relation to communications and meetings has been complied with to the best of the region's knowledge. The regional office is not aware of any meeting or communications with registered lobbyists concerning the planning proposal.**

Have there been
meetings or
communications with
registered lobbyists? : **No**

If Yes, comment :

Supporting notes

Internal Supporting
Notes :

On 9 July 2014, a planning proposal was received by the Department, which seeks to include Strathfield Synagogue as a local heritage item, by amending the Strathfield LEP 2012. The Department requested additional information to support the proposal which was received by 8 August 2014, and included an updated planning proposal.

The following development controls currently apply to the site:

- Zoning: R2 Low Density Residential
- Building Height: 8.5 metres
- Minimum lot size: 560m²
- Location: Amongst low-density housing in Strathfield, approximately 900 metres from town centre
- Surrounding Heritage: Scattered local heritage items; not included in the Heritage Conservation area; the block contains 2 other local heritage items.

BACKGROUND

The Strathfield Synagogue Jewish Congregation has been involved in the subject site since 1949, with construction of the building completed in 1959. The Strathfield Synagogue closed in March 2012 due to lack of numbers. A 12,000 signatory petition was signed by the community to save the synagogue from being sold off, generated by the ex-Rabbi. Whilst the Synagogue building is currently not in use, other buildings on the property are in use (one being a Kindergarten).

HERITAGE REVIEW AND CONCLUSIONS

In April 2013, Strathfield Council commissioned a Heritage Assessment Review to determine whether Strathfield Synagogue had the potential to be listed as a local heritage item under the Strathfield LEP 2012. The Review was prepared by Architectural Projects and submitted to Strathfield Council on 13 September 2013, with an updated version submitted on 10 March 2014. The Review was prepared using the methodology within 'The Conservation Management Plan' by Dr Semple Kerr (6th Edition), the Australian ICOMOS Burra Charter and its Guidelines.

The Review recommended the Synagogue be listed as a local heritage item for historic, social and aesthetic reasons, concluding the site:

- fulfilled 6 of the 7 criteria within the NSW Heritage Assessment Criteria; and

Strathfield LEP 2012 - Amendment to list Strathfield Synagogue, at 19 Florence Street Strathfield, as a local heritage item

- the significance of the site can be appreciated, despite cessation of use.

OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENT AND HERITAGE

On 23 July 2014, the Department wrote to the Office of Environment and Heritage seeking their feedback on the planning proposal.

On 22 August 2014, a formal response was received from the Office which raised no objection to the proposal and noted that listing an item of local significance is a matter for the local Council. The Office counselled that advice from the NSW Heritage Council's Religious Property Advisory Panel may be sought by Council, if it deems necessary.

External Supporting Notes :

In April 2013, Strathfield Council commissioned a Heritage Assessment Review to determine whether Strathfield Synagogue, 19 Florence Street Strathfield, is an item of local heritage significance, and if so, to list the site as a local heritage item.

The Heritage Assessment Review found Strathfield Synagogue had local heritage value in relation to historical evolution, historic association, social value, aesthetic value, rarity and representative significance.

On 20 May 2014, Strathfield Council resolved to prepare a planning proposal, seeking to list Strathfield Synagogue as a local heritage item.

Adequacy Assessment

Statement of the objectives - s55(2)(a)

Is a statement of the objectives provided? **Yes**

Comment : **The objective of the planning proposal is to protect Strathfield Synagogue, 19 Florence Street Strathfield, by listing the building as a local heritage item under Schedule 5 of the Strathfield LEP 2012.**

Explanation of provisions provided - s55(2)(b)

Is an explanation of provisions provided? **Yes**

Comment : **The planning proposal seeks to amend Strathfield LEP 2012 by:**
- amending Schedule 5 to include 19 Florence Street Strathfield as a local heritage item;
and
- amending the relevant Heritage Map to include 19 Florence Street as a local heritage item (General Item).

The provisions under Schedule 5 are to be amended as follows:

- Suburb: Strathfield**
- Item Name: Strathfield Synagogue**
- Address: 19 Florence Street**
- Property Description: Lots 1-5 DP 456916 and Lots 13-15 DP 581**
- Significance: Local**

Justification - s55 (2)(c)

a) Has Council's strategy been agreed to by the Director General? **No**

b) S.117 directions identified by RPA : **2.3 Heritage Conservation**

* May need the Director General's agreement

Is the Director General's agreement required? **No**

c) Consistent with Standard Instrument (LEPs) Order 2006 : **Yes**

d) Which SEPPs have the RPA identified?

Strathfield LEP 2012 - Amendment to list Strathfield Synagogue, at 19 Florence Street Strathfield, as a local heritage item

e) List any other matters that need to be considered :

Council has not identified any SEPPs as being relevant to the planning proposal.

There are three additional matters that need to be considered, including the NSW Heritage Assessment Criteria, Strathfield Development Control Plan 2005 and objections received by Council and then forwarded to the Department.

NSW HERITAGE ASSESSMENT CRITERIA

The planning proposal states that Strathfield Synagogue meets 6 of the 7 Heritage Assessment Criteria, as detailed below:

Criteria A + B: Historical Evolution & Historic Association

- Strathfield Synagogue Complex was established in 1949 and the Synagogue built in 1958. It illustrates the dramatic increase in the Jewish population, post-war, into western Sydney. It has strong associations with the Conference on Jewish Material Claims Against Germany and is claimed to represent significance to local holocaust survivors and the Hebrew Congregation in relation to the 6 million views lost in the Holocaust. The report also declares an association with the NSW Board of Jewish Education.

Criteria C: Aesthetic Value

- The Synagogue is declared to be a good example of prominent modernist émigré by architect HP Oser. The main form of the original 1959 building and Hall interior remain intact. It demonstrates the Post-War International style (despite additions to the entry and west wing).

Criteria D: Social Value

- The Synagogue was the focus of Jewish communal worship in western Sydney since its construction. The Synagogue has strong ties to the Strathfield and District Hebrew Community and Holocaust commemorative plaques and plantings are on the site. The Synagogue closed in 2012 and the ex-Rabbi generated a petition to save the building, producing 12,000 signatures.

Criteria F + G: Rarity & Representativeness

- The Synagogue is the only surviving built synagogue from the post-war period in western Sydney. It is described as a rare surviving example of post-war International style synagogue in Strathfield. It is also declared to represent an example of post war Jewish cultural facilities.

STRATHFIELD DCP 2005

The planning proposal is consistent with the objectives of the Development Control Plan, as the listing of Strathfield Synagogue will assist in preserving community and cultural values.

OBJECTIONS

Two other Heritage Assessment Reviews were commissioned independently. Reports conducted by Graham Brooks and Associates on 13 December 2013 and NBRSPartners on 30 June 2014 concluded the site does not warrant a local heritage listing for the following reasons:

- the site has limited heritage value, which is reduced by the total cessation of the original use (as a Synagogue);
- the items' aesthetic values are considered to be moderate; and
- the historic significance of the region and subject site is effectively communicated through the Jewish Museum.

The reviews concluded there is no substantial evidence for local heritage significance in regards to the NSW Heritage Assessment Criteria.

The listing of the Strathfield Synagogue as a local heritage item is disputed, as the Board which governs the Synagogue disagrees with the suggestion that the site is of

**Strathfield LEP 2012 - Amendment to list Strathfield Synagogue, at 19 Florence Street
Strathfield, as a local heritage item**

heritage significance. The reports commissioned by the Board suggest the site does not warrant heritage listing. The main arguments are:

- the site does not meet the NSW Heritage Assessment Criteria, and only has potential moderate aesthetic value;
- the site's limited heritage value has been reduced by the cessation of use of the Synagogue; and
- Council's Heritage Report contains numerous factual errors, mainly due to significantly failing to account for the information provided by the Jewish Community.

Have inconsistencies with items a), b) and d) being adequately justified? **N/A**

If No, explain :

Mapping Provided - s55(2)(d)

Is mapping provided? **Yes**

Comment : **The maps are adequate for public exhibition. The maps indicate the subject item, and the current and proposed provisions for the site under the amendment to Strathfield LEP 2012.**

Community consultation - s55(2)(e)

Has community consultation been proposed? **Yes**

Comment : **Council proposes a community consultation period of 28 days. Notwithstanding, the planning team recommend a community consultation period of 14 days, as the planning proposal is considered low impact, in accordance with the Department's 'A Guide to preparing LEPs'.**

Additional Director General's requirements

Are there any additional Director General's requirements? **No**

If Yes, reasons :

Overall adequacy of the proposal

Does the proposal meet the adequacy criteria? **Yes**

If No, comment :

Proposal Assessment

Principal LEP:

Due Date :

Comments in relation to Principal LEP : **Strathfield LEP 2012 was notified on 15 March 2013.**

Assessment Criteria

Need for planning proposal : **Council prepared the planning proposal in response to the findings of a Heritage Assessment Review commissioned by Council, and prepared by Architectural Projects Pty Ltd, which determined if the site was of local heritage significance. The report recommended the amendment of Strathfield LEP to accommodate the listing of the site.**

A planning proposal is the best means of achieving the objective of protecting the Strathfield Synagogue as a local heritage item.

Strathfield LEP 2012 - Amendment to list Strathfield Synagogue, at 19 Florence Street Strathfield, as a local heritage item

Consistency with strategic planning framework :

The planning proposal is consistent with the relevant strategic framework.

METROPOLITAN PLAN FOR SYDNEY 2036

The Metropolitan Plan aims to 'achieve equity, liveability and social inclusion and to protect places of special space and heritage value'.

The planning proposal demonstrates consistency with:

- Strategic Direction B(Action B3.3): protection and adaptive reuse of heritage items;
- Strategic Direction H (Action H.4): achieving equity, liveability and social inclusion, supporting protection of heritage and cultural value; continue to identify, enliven and protect places of special cultural, social and community value.

The planning proposal meets Action H.4 by protecting places of cultural, social and community value resulting from the sites history with the Jewish Congregation, and wider Jewish community involvement, and recognition of the community support by the 12,000 signatory petition for retention of the building.

DRAFT INNER WEST SUB-REGIONAL STRATEGY

The draft Inner West Subregional Strategy aims to 'protect scenic, heritage and environmental assets, and conserve Sydney's cultural heritage'. The planning proposal is consistent with the Strategy, Key Direction E (Environment and Heritage), by intending to protect the heritage assets of the Synagogue, which in turn is a part of Sydney's cultural heritage regarding the Jewish community.

STRATHFIELD LEP 2012

The proposal is consistent with the Strathfield LEP 2012 clause 5.10 Heritage Conservation, which aims to conserve the environmental and cultural heritage.

COMMUNITY STRATEGIC PLAN

The planning proposal is consistent with the Councils Community Strategic Plan, Strathfield 2025. The Plan includes a community goal, Prosperity and Opportunity (3) to:

- Retain local character and value heritage.
- Attempt to celebrate Strathfield's history and heritage.
- Create a strong sense of civic pride (Prosperity and Opportunity Goal 3.3.1).

The listing of the Synagogue would promote this community goal by retaining local character and valuing Strathfield's heritage and history, whilst retaining the civic pride toward the site, as was expressed in the 12,000 signatory petition to save the building.

SECTION 117 DIRECTIONS

Council have identified only one section 117 direction applicable to this site. The planning proposal is consistent with Section 2.3 Heritage Conservation of s.117 Ministerial Directions, because it aims conserve items of environmental heritage significance.

Environmental social economic impacts :

Council indicates there are no anticipated likely environmental or economic issues.

There are minimal economic implications, notably relating the Congregation's concern for inhibiting future development of the site. Listing Strathfield Synagogue as a local heritage item will have social implications, both positive and negative. The Heritage Assessment Review, the main supporting document for the planning proposal, indicates three development options for the site, whereby two retain any potential heritage value of the site.

POSITIVE

Council's Heritage Assessment Review argues the Synagogue represents the expansion of Sydney's Jewish community into the western suburbs, particularly into Strathfield. Listing the Synagogue as a local heritage site would have a positive social impact on the community, by retaining the socially, historic and aesthetically significant site which has

**Strathfield LEP 2012 - Amendment to list Strathfield Synagogue, at 19 Florence Street
Strathfield, as a local heritage item**

been well-established since 1958.

NEGATIVE

However, the Synagogue's congregation Board, and some members of the Jewish Congregation are opposed to the Synagogue's local heritage listing as:

- it will prevent future development of the site;
- the building has been modified since original construction; and
- the building is not important as a stand-alone war memorial.
- the Synagogue is unused and the use needs to be changed;
- there are on-going maintenance issues with the building; and
- the sites use as a war memorial has been questioned.

CONCLUSION

There are positive and negative social implications for the planning proposal. The opposition is relatively minor, in comparison to the 12,000 signatory petition, and is namely the community most closely associated with the site. The proposal is of local significance, and is therefore considered to be a matter for the local Council. The proposal is justified for support, as this will enable community consultation and the proposal to be considered by Council at a local level.

Assessment Process

Proposal type : **Routine** Community Consultation Period : **14 Days**

Timeframe to make LEP : **6 months** Delegation : **RPA**

Public Authority Consultation - 56(2) (d) : **Office of Environment and Heritage**

Is Public Hearing by the PAC required? **No**

(2)(a) Should the matter proceed ? **Yes**

If no, provide reasons :

Resubmission - s56(2)(b) : **No**

If Yes, reasons :

Identify any additional studies, if required. :

If Other, provide reasons :

Identify any internal consultations, if required :

No internal consultation required

Is the provision and funding of state infrastructure relevant to this plan? **No**

If Yes, reasons :

Documents

Document File Name	DocumentType Name	Is Public

**Strathfield LEP 2012 - Amendment to list Strathfield Synagogue, at 19 Florence Street
Strathfield, as a local heritage item**

Planning Team Recommendation

Preparation of the planning proposal supported at this stage : **Recommended with Conditions**

S.117 directions: **2.3 Heritage Conservation**

Additional Information : **It is recommended that the planning proposal proceed, subject to the following conditions:**

1. The planning proposal be supported;
2. Council be given authorisation for plan making delegation;
3. The planning proposal be considered as routine and exhibited for a period of 14 days;
4. A public hearing is not required;
5. Consultation is required with the Office of Environment and Heritage; and
6. The planning proposal be finalised within 6 months from the week following the date of Gateway determination

Supporting Reasons : **The planning proposal is supported for the following reasons:**

- a) The proposal is supported by a robust heritage study;
- b) It is consistent with s117 Direction 2.3 Heritage Conservation;
- c) It is consistent with the strategic planning framework;
- d) Future adaptive reuse and other development potential remains for the site under the proposal;
- e) The proposal is of local significance, and is therefore considered a matter for the local Council;
- f) Supporting the proposal will enable community consultation;
- g) The Office of Environment and Heritage raised no objection to the proposal; and
- h) The Office of Environment and Heritage counselled that Council may seek further advice from the NSW Heritage Council's Religious Property Advisory Panel.

Signature:

MARTIN COOPER

Printed Name:



Date:

30/09/2014